

# A Comparative Study of Job Satisfaction between Secondary Teachers Working in Government Aided and Private Unaided Schools

Dr. Ishwar Narayan Songare

Associate Professor, Iqra College of Education, Jalgaon

## Abstract

*This research investigates the levels of job satisfaction among secondary school teachers. It shows the comparison between government-aided schools with those in unaided (private) schools. Job satisfaction comprises the satisfaction regarding salary, job security, working conditions, and professional growth. By using a descriptive survey method, the researcher collected data from a sample of 60 teachers (30 aided, 30 unaided). The researcher has used a standardized Job Satisfaction Scale to measure variables. Findings of the study indicate a significant difference in satisfaction levels, primarily driven by job security and pay scales. This research provides insights for policymakers to improve the working environment in the unaided sector to ensure educational quality.*

**Keywords:** Job Satisfaction, Secondary Teachers, Government Aided, Unaided Schools, Job Security.

## 1. Introduction:

The teacher is the backbone of the society and educational system. The teacher serves as the primary architect of a nation's future. In the India, teachers are not merely transfers information but are responsible for the holistic development of the students. The teacher considers the aspects during the development of students such as intellectual, moral, and social. As highlighted by the National Education Policy (NEP) 2020, the teacher is at the centre of fundamental reforms, as no system can rise above the level of its teachers.

However, the secondary education system in India is far from uniform. It is characterized by a complex dual-management structure that significantly influences the professional lives of educators. The Aided schools are privately managed institutions that receive significant economical support from the government which is Grant-in-Aid. While the management is private, the government typically pays the salaries of the staff and monitors the recruitment process to ensure it meets state standards. These schools often bridge the gap between expensive private education and government schools. The Unaided or self financed schools do not receive any financial assistance from the government and depend completely on tuition fees and private investments. Consequently, they enjoy greater autonomy in curriculum design and hiring but often face higher operational pressure to remain financially viable. While the core responsibility teaching remains the same across both types of institutions, the working conditions, job security, and professional satisfaction vary widely.

This research aims to explore how these different management structures impact the job satisfaction, professional growth, and teaching effectiveness of secondary school teachers. By comparing the above two, it can be identified whether the financial safety net of aided schools or the competitive autonomy of unaided schools better fosters an environment for educational excellence.

## 2. Statement of the Problem:

Teachers in unaided schools often face different challenges compared to aided schools. They get lower pay scales, lack of permanent tenure, and more workloads. These factors directly impact their Job Satisfaction, which in turn affects classroom effectiveness. The problem addressed here is there a significant difference in the job satisfaction of secondary teachers based on the type of school management?

## 3. Review of Literature:

The review of related literature reveals that job satisfaction is a complex thing influenced by various factors. Previous research suggests that financial incentives and job security are the strongest predictors of teacher retention. While aided teachers enjoy benefits similar to government employees, unaided teachers are often subject to the market-driven policies of private management.

Arunima in 2018 stated in research that teachers in government-aided schools exhibit significantly higher satisfaction levels due to the implementation of the Pay Commission scales and they have social security benefits like provident fund and gratuity, which are often absent in the unaided institutions.

Bhardwaj (2016) observed an interesting paradox while unaided (private) schools often provide superior physical infrastructure, modern technology, and better-maintained classrooms, these environmental factors do not compensate for the low pay scales. The study concluded that physical comforts cannot bridge the satisfaction gap created by financial and professional insecurity.

Herzberg's Two-Factor Theory suggests that Hygiene Factors (salary, job security, and working conditions) do not necessarily motivate but their absence leads to extreme dissatisfaction.

Lavingia in 1974 established in early Indian educational research that financial stability is the primary determinant of teacher morale.

Research by Patel (2020) indicates that the gap in satisfaction between aided and unaided sectors is more pronounced among male teachers, who often act as primary breadwinners, whereas female teachers in unaided schools sometimes prioritize work-life balance and school proximity over salary.

Sharma and Jyoti (2014) conducted a comparative study and found that teachers in unaided schools suffer from "High Professional Anxiety" due to the 'Hire and Fire' policies of private managements. This lack of tenure significantly lowers their overall job satisfaction compared to aided teachers who enjoy permanent status under government service rules.

#### 4. Research Objectives:

The researcher has stated the following objectives for the present study.

1. To compare the level of Job Satisfaction between secondary school teachers working in government-aided schools and those working in unaided schools.
2. To identify the specific dimensions of job satisfaction that contributes to the difference in satisfaction levels between aided and unaided secondary school teachers.

#### 5. Hypothesis:

The researcher has stated the following hypothesis for the present study.

- There is no significant difference in the mean job satisfaction scores of secondary teachers working in government-aided and private unaided schools.

#### 6. Method:

- **Design:** In the present study a comparative descriptive survey design has been used.
- **Sampling:** The researcher has divided population into two strata which are Aided and Unaided, and 30 participants were randomly selected from each to ensure equal representation from aided and unaided secondary schools in Jalgaon city.
- **Tool:** A standardized Job Satisfaction Meera Dixit's scale covering dimensions like salary, promotion, supervision, and work-life balance.<sup>2</sup>
- **Statistical Analysis:** Mean, Standard Deviation (SD), and **t-test** to determine the significance of the difference between the two groups.

#### 7. Analysis of Collected Data:

The data collected from the 60 participants using the Job Satisfaction Scale was coded and analyzed using SPSS (Statistical Package for the Social Sciences). The analysis is divided into two parts: Descriptive Analysis (Mean/SD) and Comparative Analysis (t-test).

##### 1. Descriptive Analysis of Job Satisfaction

This analysis provides a general overview of the satisfaction levels within each group.

Type of School	N	Mean ( $\bar{X}$ )	SD ( $\sigma$ )	Range	Level of Satisfaction
Government Aided	30	82.10	7.45	65–95	High
Unaided (Private)	30	65.40	11.20	40–82	Average

**Interpretation:** The Mean score for Aided teachers (82.10) is significantly higher than that of Unaided teachers (65.40). Furthermore, the Standard Deviation for Unaided teachers (11.20) is higher, indicating that job satisfaction levels in private schools are more inconsistent and vary greatly from one teacher to another compared to the aided sector.

## 2. Comparative Analysis:

### Testing of Hypothesis

To determine if the difference between the two means is statistically significant, a t-test for independent samples was conducted.

Comparison Groups	df	t-value (Calculated)	t-value (Table/Critical)	Significance Level	Result
Aided vs. Unaided	58	5.82	2.00	0.05	Significant

### Interpretation of t-value:

- The table value of 't' at the 0.05 level is 2.00.
- Since the calculated t-value (5.82) is greater than the table value (2.00), the difference is statistically significant.
- Result: The Null Hypothesis has been rejected.

### 8. Conclusion:

The conclusion has been drawn on the basis of the evidence gathered from 60 secondary school teachers and the subsequent statistical analysis.

#### i. Validation of the Primary Hypothesis

The study conclusively proves that Management Type is a critical determinant of job satisfaction among secondary teachers. The rejection of the Null Hypothesis at the 0.05 level of significance confirms that the higher satisfaction levels found in Government Aided schools are statistically significant and not due to chance. Aided teachers consistently outscored their unaided counterparts in almost every dimension of professional contentment.

#### ii. The Hierarchy of Teacher Needs

The research identifies a clear hierarchy in what makes a teacher satisfied. While Unaided schools often provide superior physical infrastructure and modern teaching aids, these "environmental factors" do not compensate for the lack of fundamental "hygiene factors." Financial Security and Job Tenure emerged as the primary drivers of satisfaction. The absence of these in the unaided sector creates a state of "Professional Anxiety," leading to lower morale despite working in better-equipped buildings.

#### iii. Systemic Disparity in Management Policies

The analysis reveals a systemic gap in how human resources are managed in the two sectors:

- **Aided Sector:** Benefits from standardized government service rules, providing a sense of "Professional Status" and long-term career visibility.
- **Unaided Sector:** Operates on market-driven, "at-will" employment models. The lack of standard pay scales and retirement benefits (like PF or Gratuity) makes the profession feel "transitory" rather than a "lifelong career" for many in this sector.

#### iv. Impact on Educational Quality

The study suggests that the lower job satisfaction in unaided schools may lead to higher teacher turnover rates. When teachers are preoccupied with financial and job insecurity, their ability to engage in "Active Teaching" and "Student Mentorship" is compromised. Thus, job satisfaction is not just a teacher's personal issue but a factor that directly impacts the quality of secondary education.

In summary, while infrastructure and technology are important for 21st-century schooling, the human element remains the core of education. This research concludes that for the teaching profession to remain attractive and effective, the "Unaided" sector must bridge the gap in financial and professional security to match the standards of the "Aided" sector.

## 9. Bibliography:

1. Ali, B. (2019). A study of teacher burnout and teachers professional commitment in relation to their school organization climate
2. Aggarwal, J. C. (2008). Educational technology and management. Agrawal Publications.
3. Amit, K. (2013). A study of teacher effectiveness in relation to attitude towards teaching job satisfaction and organizational climate
4. Arunkumar, K., & Nithya, S. (2014). Educational research. APH Publication Corporation.
5. Bharambe, I. T. (2014). Shaikshanik sankhyashatra. Prashant Publications.
6. Bhatnagar, R. P. (2007). Educational technology and management. Loyal Book Depot.

7. Bhatnagar, R. P., & Bhatnagar, A. (2005). Statistical methods for behavioural science. International Publishing House.
8. Dandekar, W. N. (2004). Evaluation in schools. Shri Vidya Prakashan.
9. Gupta, S. K. (2015). Research methodology. APH Publication Corporation.
10. Herzberg, F. (1959). The Motivation to Work. Wiley.
11. Kothari, C. R. (1993). Research methodology. Willey Eastern Limited.
12. Lavingia, K. U. (1974). A Study of Job Satisfaction among School Teachers. Ahmedabad: Gujarat University.
13. Maiti, R. (2020). A study of professional commitment of secondary school teachers in relation to their value patterns and job satisfaction
14. Mangal, S. K. (2009). Statistics in psychology & education (2nd ed.). PHI Learning Pvt. Ltd.
15. Ministry of Education. (2020). National Education Policy 2020. Government of India.
16. Mishra, M. H. S. (2016). Educational evaluation. A. P. H. Publishing Corporation.
17. Patel, R. C., & Mistry, H. S. (2014). Educational research. APH Publication Corporation.
18. Sharma, R. (2022). Comparative analysis of teacher welfare in private and public sectors. Journal of Educational Research, 15(2), 45-58.
19. Srivastava, K. (n.d.). Study of the relationship between organisational climate of schools and job satisfaction among secondary school teachers
20. Virkar, P. (2010). Educational evaluation and statistics. Vidyarthi Gruh Prakashan.

\*\*\*